

ABSTRACT

Lisa Ciccone, *For a new idea of poetry in glosses and commentaries on Horace's Ars poetica*

This essay examines the development of the idea of poetry in late antique and medieval glosses to Horace's *Ars poetica*. It is one of the first results of the work carried out for the *Thesaurus Glossarum et Commentariorum*, a new research tool that is being created at the University of Zurich as part of the project *The Ancient World as seen from Medieval glosses*. The investigation of the terms *poesis*, *poetria*, *ars poetica*, *scientia poetandi* and *poet* makes it possible to demonstrate in particular how innovative the conception of poetry is in the commentary *Communiter*. In his *accessus*, as well as in the *accessus* of Pace da Ferrara's and Guizzardo da Bologna's commentary, both concerning Goffredo di Vinosalvo's *Poetria nova*, we read that poetry is *scientia* distinct from *Rhetorica* and that it belongs to the *pars sermocinalis* of *philosophia*.

Lisa Ciccone

Università di Zurigo
lisa.ciccone@sglp.uzh.ch

Marco Cigna, *Dependence of exegesis and textual transfer in the two commentaries on Terence by Aelius Donatus and Eugraphius*

The aim of this paper is to reflect on some textual analogies between the two commentaries on Terence attributed to Aelius Donatus and Eugraphius. The main studies in this regard date back to a period from the end of 19th century to the beginning of 20th century. More modern criticism, however, seems not to have been very interested in the question, suggesting, more or less explicitly, that the similarities are to be explained by a dependence of Eugraphius' commentary on that of Donatus. My article will analyze four case studies, trying to demonstrate that the relationship of dependence between the two works is inverse and that parts of Eugraphius' text have penetrated, probably in the form of a gloss, into the current form of Donatus' commentary. These results may perhaps be useful not only for a better understanding of the Eugraphius' commentary and its peculiarities, but for a more critical perspective on Donatus' work.

Marco Cigna

Università Ca' Foscari Venezia
marco.cigna@unive.it

Paolo Odorico, *Creating through glosses: Marginalia as an element of literary production in Byzantium*

The study of notes written in the margins or at the end of manuscripts, as glosses related or not to the content of the codex, attracted a certain amount of interest in the 80's. There were subsequently no other systematic studies with regard to the byzantine world. I have therefore decided to consider three cases of the construction of literary texts relative to the manuscripts that contain them. I will first discuss the *Scala Paradisi* of John Climacus, to demonstrate how the Byzantines enriched a text through notes added at the end of the text, that contributed to the transmission of knowledge. I will then deal with three poems added to a blank page at the end of a Paris manuscript, once again relative to the content of the codex, to see how simple variations in citation could participate in the articulation of political ideology. Finally, I would like to bring attention to a letter at the end of a Venice manuscript, to consider how the text could have been inspired by the content of the manuscript, even within a completely different context.

Paolo Odorico

École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales, Paris
odorico@ehess.fr

Michele De Lazzer, *The Glossae Nonii: the glossator's modus operandi*

Nonius Marcellus, a North African grammarian lived between IV and V century d. C., composed a vast treatise on the Latin Language entitled *Conpendiosa doctrina* and formed by XX books, each consisting of a different number of voices. In the initial phase of its transmission, an unknown scholar wrote in the margins of a Nonian manuscript a sort of index, copying, near almost every voices, the related lemma and a short explanation, in most cases quoted from the text of Nonius. These *marginalia* were transmitted with the *Conpendiosa doctrina*, and were only preserved in the second branch of its tradition. At a later time, another unknown scholar, having a nonian manuscript with these notes, decided to copy *marginalia* of books II and I separately from the text of Nonius, so as to form two distinct series of glosses, arranged one after the other and only transmitted by ms. Leiden, Bibliotheek der Universiteit, B.P.L. 67 F. Towards the publication of a new critical edition of the second series, formed by *marginalia* from book I, the aim of this essay is to shed light on the main criteria adopted during the composition of these lexicographical material and make a comparison, at the same time, with those used for the first series, assembled, in turn, with

marginalia from book II. Analysis will be specially devoted to glosses (and *marginalia*) quoted from Nonius voices dedicated to words such as *ablegare*, *arcantum*, *Avernus*, *caries* and *concinare*.

Michele De Lazzer

Università degli Studi di Urbino Carlo Bo
S.I.S.M.E.L. Firenze

Marina Giani, *Annotators and Correctors of Augustine's De civitate Dei in 9th-century Reims*

The contribution analyses the marginal glosses to Augustine's *De civitate Dei* in the manuscript Bourges, Bibliothèque municipale, 94 (84), produced in Reims in the last third of the 9th century. Through a palaeographic and philological investigation, the author distinguishes three layers of annotations: the first coincides with notes copied from the antigraph; the second highlights expressions notable for style or lexicon; the third is attributed to a particularly learned reader-corrector, who intervenes with corrections, synonyms and grammatical comments. Of particular interest is a note on the formula *trina deitas*, associated with the Carolingian debate opposing Gottschalk of Orbais to Hincmar of Reims.

Marina Giani

Università degli Studi di Milano
marina.giani@unimi.it

Jean-Yves Tilliette, *Medieval Latin Literature: A History Written in the Margins?*

By virtue of its character as «literature of the second degree», the literature of the Latin Middle Ages can in principle be considered to lie «on the margins» of the classical, biblical or patristic models from which it draws its inspiration. After showing how, in a concrete way, the very manner in which glosses are organized in the space of the page is potentially a source of literary invention, we propose three examples: Thomas de Perseigne digests the commentaries made on the *Song of Songs* by all his predecessors, transforming them into useful material for preaching; the parallel or competing exegeses of Ovid's *Metamorphoses* devised by commentators turn one and the same episode into the matrix for highly diverse narratives; finally, it is not implausible to think that, following the rules of a subtle dialogue between the text and its gloss, it was Geoffroy de Vinsauf's own poetic

compositions that prompted him to write the *Poetria nova*, and not the other way round.

Jean-Yves Tilliette

Université de Genève, Institut de France
jean-yves.tilliette@unige.ch

Federico De Dominicis, *How to construct the Glossa ordinaria to Revelation between glossed and continuous Commentaries*

After an introduction briefly tracing the history of the *Glossa ordinaria* and the links with the exegetical school of Anselm of Laon, the paper presents the origins of the earliest phase of the *Glossa Ordinaria* to Revelation. The hypothesis is tested in the light of four commentaries, produced between Saint-Thierry and Laon within a few years, between the 11th and mid-12th century. Above all, the fourth of these commentaries (*inc. Deus et Dominus Pater*), transmitted in two textual redactions, is one of the principal sources to the *Glossa ordinaria* to Revelation and allows us to understand the mechanisms that led to its production.

Federico De Dominicis

Université de Genève
federico.dedominicis@unige.ch

Nicoletta Palmieri, *Schematic representations of the content of the Isagoge Iohannitii: from notes in the margin to glossaries via diagrams*

As the first item of the *Ars medicinae* (*Articella*), the *Isagoge Iohannitii* enjoyed a very wide circulation, demonstrated in numerous codices by the abundance of annotations in their margins and between their lines. In this article I study those *glose* which relate to technical terms in the *diuisiones* of Iohannitius. They are transmitted in the margin of copies of the text but they were also gathered into lists which resemble medical glossaries relating to the *Isagoge*. These glossary entries testify to the reshaping of knowledge in a very special form, i.e. schematic representations of the *Isagoge Iohannitii*. To date, six complete witnesses (plus one fragmentary) of a kind of glossary in diagrammatic form relating to the *Isagoge* are known: here, the *diuisiones* in Iohannitius are depicted as tree diagrams, and the definitions of the various terms are given as *glose* inserted into the spaces between the branches of such a tree. The commentaries on the *Isagoge* created by Saler-

nitan masters of the 12th century will be their main source; however, the precise identification of the authors where they originally came from remains a difficult task.

Nicoletta Palmieri

Université de Reims, Champagne-Ardenne
nicoletta.darlon@univ-reims.fr

Charles Burnett, *Glosses and Styles in Arabic-Latin Translations of the Twelfth Century*

Two styles of presenting works translated from Arabic into Latin in the twelfth century can be recognized: one is characterised by the presence of glosses within the text or in the margins, the other avoids glosses altogether and aims for an eloquent text. One may call these respectively the didactic, and the rhetorical style. The differences between these styles is exemplified by two translations of Sahl ibn Bishr's *50 Precepts*, one by John of Seville, the other by Hermann of Carinthia. The differences are stark, and call for explanation.

Charles Burnett

The Warburg Institute, London
charles.burnett@sas.ac.uk

Elena Berti, *Engaging textual reconstructions revealed by marginal annotations to Peter of Abano's «Liber compilationis physionomie»*

Glosses serve as the most apparent indicators of the scribe's engagement with the transcribed text. This practice of annotating the text sees a progressive intensification within the margins of late medieval manuscripts, the era to which most of Pietro d'Abano *Liber compilationis physionomie* manuscripts belong. Dating back to the late 13th century, this text compiles the physiognomic sources prevalent during that period. The nature of the text, coupled with 15th-century witnesses, offers an intriguing case study for analyzing the strategies employed by late medieval intellectuals in addressing the textual challenges presented by the *Liber compilationis physionomie*. In particular, the analysis will first focus on the manuscript München, BSB, Clm 637, copied by the humanist physician Hartmann Schedel. Subsequently, we will inves-

tigate the copying practices of the scribes of the manuscripts, Bodleian Library, Canon. misc. 46 and Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Barb. lat. 341. Finally, we conclude with a study of the phenomenon of intrusive glosses, illustrated by excerpts from Bartholomaeus Anglicus' *De proprietatibus rerum* printed in Venice in 1548, and an anecdote featuring Socrates and the physiognomist from Cicero.

Elena Berti
 Universität Zürich
 elena.berti@sglp.uzh.ch

Cecilia Panti, *From Fragmented Library to Writing Workshop: Robert Grosseteste's Marginalia in the Accounts of Thomas Gascoigne and William of Alnwick*

This study examines two key sources that illuminate the role and significance of marginal writings in Robert Grosseteste's intellectual practice. The first is the set of numerous references – many of them *marginalia* themselves – inserted by the theologian and Oxford chancellor Thomas Gascoigne (d. 1457) into manuscripts bequeathed by the Bishop of Lincoln to the library of the Franciscan convent in Oxford. These notes help identify Grosseteste's hand in glosses and indexing marks scattered across the theological and biblical manuscripts he once owned. The second source is a notable testimony by the Franciscan master William of Alnwick (d. 1333), who offers a detailed account of Grosseteste's working method involving *marginalia* and *cedulae*. He provides specific insights into the structure of one of Grosseteste's philosophical works, the *Commentary on the Physics*, which he describes as a striking example of a text assembled from auto-graph glosses. According to Alnwick, these additions included not only genuine interpretive notes but also passages he characterizes as 'inauthentic' or 'non-authoritative'. Taken together, these testimonies demonstrate how glosses and *marginalia* served as essential instruments in Grosseteste's scholarly activity – as an author, commentator, and translator.

Cecilia Panti
 Università di Roma Tor Vergata
 cecilia.panti@uniroma2.it

Sébastien Moureau, *Azoc id est mercurius. Alchemical Glossaries in Manuscripts*

Among the instruments available to medieval scholars for engaging with alchemical treatises, the glossary remains a relatively overlooked tool. Nevertheless, numerous alchemical manuscripts are supplemented with such apparatuses. This article presents the first comprehensive study devoted to manuscript alchemical glossaries. Based on a corpus of 76 glossaries identified in 52 manuscripts – primarily dating from the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries – this research presents a synthesis of the features of these tools, accompanied by reflections on their authorship, intended purposes, functions, and methods of compilation. An analytical inventory of the listed alchemical glossaries is appended to the article.

Sébastien Moureau

FNRS / Université catholique de Louvain
sebastien.moureau@uclouvain.be

Stefan Drechsler, *Advanced Use and Textual Change: Paratextual Commentaries in Medieval Norwegian and Icelandic Law Manuscripts*

This article discusses the use of marginalia in medieval Norwegian and Icelandic law manuscripts in regards to being a space for creative engagement with the text, as well as being an indicator of gradual change of its textual content over time. The article has two aims: first, it maps the different forms of paratextual commentaries in medieval law manuscripts from Norway and Iceland. Second, it explores the variety of paratextual commentaries added by a learned scribe in ca. 1500 to *Svalbarðsbók* (Reykjavík, Stofnun Árna Magnússonar í íslenskum fræðum, AM 343 fol., 1330–40), one of the key manuscripts from medieval Iceland that features paratextual commentary. The article draws particular attention to the question of how textual additions reflect the advanced use of, and legal changes within, the Norwegian and Icelandic law books produced and used during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. It is argued that it is especially those law texts that were supposed to bring more stability in the period after 1270 that indicate the most varied and critical reflection of their content in manuscript marginalia over time.

Stefan Drechsler

Universitetet i Bergen
stefan.drechsler@uib.no

Amos Bertolacci, *The Text or the Comments On It? Remarks on the Lithograph of the Science of the Divine Things of Avicenna's Book of the Healing (Tehran, 1885-8)*

A lithographic print of Avicenna's (Ibn Sīnā, d. 1037) metaphysical masterpiece – the *Science of Divine Things (Ilāhiyyāt)* from the *Book of the Healing (Kitāb al-Šifā')* – published in Tehran between 1885 and 1888 presents a vast and interesting exegetical apparatus, which can be defined overall as 'marginal': it partly precedes the text of the *Ilāhiyyāt* (the lithograph opens with the commentary on the first six treatises of the *Ilāhiyyāt* by Mullā Ṣadrā, d. 1050H/1640), partly surrounds it at the edge of the page (glosses by various other commentators of the 16th-18th centuries), partly intersperses with it (interlinear notations taken from the manuscripts of the *Ilāhiyyāt* or from the exegesis of the commentators mentioned above). The contribution proposes a first attempt at a historical contextualization of this important witness of Iranian philosophical publishing at the end of the nineteenth century, classifying the multifaceted exegesis of the text of the *Ilāhiyyāt* contained in it; moreover, it highlights the organization of knowledge that emerges from the way in which the lithography places metaphysics before the natural philosophy of the *Šifā'*, and advances some hypotheses on the sources used by the editors and on the respective weight that they gave to Avicenna's text and to the exegesis of his commentators within the work.

Amos Bertolacci

Scuola IMT Alti Studi Lucca
amos.bertolacci@imtlucca.it

Luigi Pirovano, *Eugraphius' Commentary on Terence between Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages: Towards a New Edition*

This paper focuses on the manuscript tradition of the *Commentum Terenti* ascribed to Eugraphius, challenging the theoretical foundations on which the last critical edition of the commentary (Wessner 1908) is based. In particular, two conclusions are drawn: (a) contrary to Wessner's opinion, it is not true that the manuscripts belonging to the so-called *recensio β* always offer a better text than those belonging to the *recensio α*; (b) considering the 'fluid' nature of the tradition, it is methodologically advisable, at least in some cases, to abandon the idea of establishing at all costs a 'unitary' text, according to the strict rules of traditional philology.

Luigi Pirovano

Università di Bologna
luigi.pirovano2@unibo.it

Roberto Gamberini, *Froumund and his school on the margins of Boethius*

For the library of the Abbey of Tegernsee, Froumund, the monastery teacher, undertook the collection and transcription of a series of Boethian works with commentaries and glosses in Latin and Old High German. His work, carried out in collaboration with his pupils, made available to them texts and teaching materials that were considered fundamental at the time, adapting them to the educational needs of the time and also adding new content. The article investigates the individuality of the master through an analysis of the four Froumund's autographs with Boethian works preserved today. It considers his intentions, his study and research activity, his exegetical attitude, the traces and instruments of his teaching profession, his work of knowledge transmission and his intellectual network. The analysis of the manuscripts also encompasses a group of seventeen additional codices from the period subsequent to Froumund's activities. This investigation demonstrates that interest in Boethius persisted at Tegernsee for an extensive period. Throughout the Middle Ages, the abbey's scriptorium and library continued to produce or acquire Boethian texts, especially with commentaries. However, it is clear that Froumund and his immediate pupils provided the most significant impetus for the study of Boethius at Tegernsee, as evidenced by the extensive group of manuscripts attributed to them.

Roberto Gamberini

Università degli Studi di Cassino e del Lazio Meridionale
European University of Technology
roberto.gamberini@unicas.it

Pierluigi Licciardello, *Monks Writing in the Margins: Variety of Interventions in the Medieval Camaldolese Tradition*

Some medieval Camaldolese manuscripts present corpora of glosses in the margins. Two case studies are proposed here. The first concerns the glosses in the Psalter Ms. London, British Library, Yates Thompson 40 (12th century), which were added in the 13th century by a Camaldolese hermit. These glosses come from many authors of the Patristic and Medieval era, including Augustine, Petrus Lombardus and the *Glossa ordinaria*, but also from 'modern' authors such as Bernard of Clairvaux and the Dominican Guillelmus Peraldus. The sources are selected with great skill, in order to identify the most important steps for the spirituality of hermits. The second case regards the glosses that accompany the normative code of the Order of Camaldoli, in the manuscripts Camaldoli, Biblioteca del Sacro Eremo 42 (early 14th century) and Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Conv. Soppr. C.VIII.380 (year 1476). These glosses explain the texts, identify cor-

respondences, put order in the norms; they show that the hermits of Camaldoli knew well the practices of religious and juridical writing of their time and are able to make original comments. The glosses were written in the late thirteenth century, when Camaldoli was in an age characterized by cultural fervor, scholastic practice and new forms of literary and documentary writing.

Pierluigi Licciardello

Università di Bologna
 pierlui.licciardello@unibo.it

Agostino Paravicini Bagliani, *Marginalia and Historical Memory: the Legend of Pope Joan*

The literary tradition of the legend of Pope Joan between the Middle Ages and Early Modern Times cannot be limited to the study of the textual tradition, but must pay attention, as far as possible, to the graphic devices used by the copyists, as well as the interpolations, censorial interventions, marginal annotations, in short, all codicological informations that testify to the reception of the legend. For this reason, in my collection of the literary testimonies of the legend up to 1500, I considered it indispensable to focus not only on the text, but also on the codicological or editorial context, not only on the textual diffusion of the legend, but also on its material diffusion. Continuing along this methodological line, I propose to re-discuss the *marginalia* I have already observed in my previous studies, putting them into a more general perspective also with the help of new information and reflections. I will do so on the assumption that annotations, transcriptions of the biography of Pope Joan or visual representations on guard sheets or in the margins of manuscripts are sources that contribute to understanding original elements of the history of this famous legend.

Agostino Paravicini Bagliani

S.I.S.M.E.L., Florence
 agostino.paravicini@unil.ch

José C. Santos Paz, *Transfers between text and transtexts in the Oraculum Angelicum of pseudo-Cyrill*

The so-called *Angelic Oracle of Cyril* circulated as part of a dossier or compilation that included other elements clearly delimited in the *mise-en-page*, which were considered unrelated to it: an epistolary exchange between Cyril and Joachim of Fiore, a comment attributed to Joachim, interlinear glosses and marginal annotations. After analyzing these ele-

ments, the unitary composition of the dossier is concluded, although it is also noted that several copies contain additions. The presence in the manuscripts of material from the lost commentary of Gilbertus Anglicus on the oracle is also reviewed. Finally, the study of the glosses present in the manuscript BAV, Borgh. 205 allow us to refute the hypothesis of their supposed Arnaldian authorship.

José C. Santos Paz
Universidade da Coruña
j.c.santos@udc.es