

*On the Persian Translations of Avicenna's Ilāhiyyāt\**

I. INTRODUCTION

The present study is intended to give a brief description of the translations from Arabic to Persian of *Ilāhiyyāt* ([Science of] Divine Things) of *Kitāb al-Šifā'* (Book of The Healing) by Ibn Sīnā (Avicenna), with particular reference to the manuscripts that are currently preserved in Iran and India. A complement to the present research will be a systematic survey of other possible *testimonia* of the translations in question, preserved in the geographical areas of the Middle East.

The second objective of the article is to present some hypotheses relating to the manuscripts consulted, mostly dating from the period of the Safavid dynasty (XVI-XVIII c.), an epoch of extraordinary cultural vitality testified to by the large number of comments and glosses on the works of the 'great teachers', as well as by the major circulation of manuscripts in Iran and in the Indo-Pakistan subcontinent<sup>1</sup>.

\* This paper is part of the ERC research project 'Philosophy on the Border of Civilizations and Intellectual Endeavours: Towards a Critical Edition of the *Metaphysics (Ilāhiyyāt of Kitāb al-Šifā')* of Avicenna (Ibn Sīnā), Acronym 'PhiBor' (<http://www.avicennaproject.eu>), based at the Scuola Normale Superiore in Pisa. My heartfelt thanks go to Prof. A. Bertolacci, PI of the abovementioned project, for giving me the opportunity to acquire and consult the codices examined and, above all, for his advice, his helpfulness and his constant scientific and human support. I am also deeply grateful to Dr. V. Pallejà de Bustinza, to Dr. G. Dadkhāh and Dr. F. Ghassemlou, for their essential collaboration in retrieving the necessary material and for the precious linguistic support they have given me. Particular thanks go to my colleagues in the PhiBor team: T. Alpina, A. Astesiano, S. Di Vincenzo and M. Scermino.

<sup>1</sup> The 'Safavid cultural Renaissance' had its apex in the epoch of 'Abbās I (r. 995-996/1588-1038/1629) and was particularly concerned with artistic disciplines, also amply encompassing sciences and philosophy. See H. M. HAMEDANEE, *History of Science in Iran in the last four centuries*, in A. Y. AL-HASSAN, M. AHMED, A. Z. ISKANDAR eds., *Science and Technology in Islam*, vol. IV, part II: Technology and Applied Sciences, Unesco Publishing, Beirut 2001, pp. 615-643; H. NASR, *Spiritual movements, Philosophy and Theology in the Safavid period*, in P. JACKSON, L. LOCKHART eds., *The Cambridge History of Iran*, vol. VI, The Timurid and Safavid Periods, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 1968-1991, pp. 656-697; C. MELVILLE ed., *Safavid Persia: The History and Politics of an Islamic Society*, vol. IV, Pembroke Persian Papers, I. B. Tauris, London - New York 1996; A. J. NEWMAN, *Safavid Iran. Rebirth of a Persian Empire*, I. B. Tauris, London - New York 2009; R. POURJAVADY, *Philosophy in Early Safavid Period: Najm al-Dīn Mahmūd al-Nayrīzī and His Writings*, Brill, Leiden - Boston 2011; ID., S. SCHMIDTKE, *An Eastern Renaissance? Greek Philosophy under the Safavids (16th-18th centuries AD)*, « Intellectual History of the Islamicate World », 3, 2015, pp. 248-290; S. RIZVI, *Isfahan School of Philosophy*, in *Encyclopaedia Iranica*, <http://www.iranicaonline.org/articles/isfahan-school-of-philosophy>; M. TERRIER, *La représentation de la sagesse grecque comme discours et mode de vie chez les philosophes šī'ites de l'Iran safavide (XI<sup>e</sup>/XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle)*, « Studia graeco-arabica », 5, 2015, pp. 299-320.

The translations from Arabic to Persian of the *Metaphysics* section of *Šifā'*, which will be the object of the present study, are set precisely in the variegated context of the Safavid epoch.

## II. MANUSCRIPTS OF THE PERSIAN TRANSLATIONS OF *İLĀHIYYĀT*

Excluding codices belonging to private collections, which are difficult to access, and some attested manuscripts still being investigated, it has been possible to identify eight copies of translations into Persian of the *Metaphysics* of *Šifā'*. Firstly the general and individual catalogues of the Iranian and Indian libraries (hereafter abbreviated as D, DA<sub>1</sub>, F, H, K, MZ, O, S) were consulted<sup>2</sup>,

### <sup>2</sup> Abbreviations:

D = ms. recorded in M. DIRĀYĀTĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-hāye Iran (Dena)* (The Abridged Catalogue of Iran Manuscripts), Al-Javad Cultural & Research Institute, Tehran 1389HŠ/2010, vol. II, p. 133, vol. VI, pp. 1202-1203.

DA<sub>1</sub> = ms. recorded in M. T. DĀNIŠPAZŪH, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Ihdā'ī-ye Āqā-yi Sayyid Muḥammad-i Miškāt, Kitābkhānah-i Dānišgāh-i Tehrān* (Catalogue méthodique, descriptif et raisonné des manuscrits philosophiques, mystiques et apologétiques persans et arabes de la Bibliothèque de l'Université de Téhéran [Don de M. le Professeur Meshkāt]), Imprimerie de l'Université, Tehran 1332HŠ/1953, vol. III, 1, pp. 199-200.

DA<sub>2</sub> = ms. recorded in Id. ed., 'Introduction', in IBN SĪNĀ, *Al-Nağāt min al-ğarq fi baḥr al-ḍalālāt, Intiṣārāt-i Dānišgāh-i Tehrān*, Tehran 1364HŠ/1985, p. 95.

ES = ms. recorded in M. J. ESMĀELĪ, *The Commentary Tradition on the Ilāhiyyāt of the Šifā' . An Historical and Bibliographical Survey*, « Sophia Perennis. The Quarterly Journal of Sapiential Wisdom and Philosophy », The Iranian Institute of Philosophy with the Collaboration of the Iranian Philosophical Society, vol. X, n. 2, Autumn and Winter 2013-2014, Serial Number 24, pp. 5-26.

F = ms. recorded in M. DIRĀYĀTĪ, *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khattī-ye Iran (Fankha)* (Union Catalogue of Iran Manuscripts), Cultural & Research Institute of Al-Javad, vol. IV, Tehran 1391HŠ/2012, pp. 785-786, vol. XXI, Tehran 1392HŠ/2013, pp. 79-80.

H = ms. recorded in A. HĀ'IRĪ, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Majlis-i Šūrā-yi Millī* (A Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Parliament Library [Persian & Arabic]), Intiṣārāt-i Mağlis, Tehran 1345HŠ/1965, vol. V, pp. 297-299, 402-404.

IS = ms. recorded in H. N. IŞFAHĀNĪ ed., 'Introduction', in IBN SĪNĀ, *Ibn-i Sīnā Kitāb al-Šifā' (Metaphysics) with Marginal Notes by Mullā Sadrā, Mīrdāmād, Khunsarī, Sabzavārī and others*. Edited with Introduction and Notes by H. N. Isfahānī Ph.D., Society for the Appreciation of Cultural Works and Dignitaries, Institute of Islamic Studies Tehran, McGill Universities, Tehran 1383HŠ/2004, pp. 58-59, 83-84, 100-101, 128.

K = ms. recorded in T. H. KANTŪRĪ, *Fihrist-i kutub-i 'arabī wa fārsī wa urdū maḥzūnah-i Kutubhānah-i Āṣafīyah-i Sarkār-i 'Ālī* (Catalogue of the Arabic, Persian and Urdu books and manuscripts in the Āṣafīyah Library), Dār al-ṭab' Sarkār-i 'Ālī, Hyderabad 1347H/1928, vol. III, pp. 492-493.

MA = ms. recorded in Y. MAHDĀVĪ, *Fihrist-i nuṣṣahā-yi muṣannaḥāt-i Ibn-i Sīnā, Bibliographie d'Ibn Sīnā, Intiṣārāt-i Dānišgāh-i Tehrān*, Tehran 1333HŠ/1954, p. 174.

MZ = ms. recorded in A. MUNZAVĪ, *Fehrestvāra-ye Ketābhā-ye Fārsī* (An Annotated Bibliography of Persian Works Including Manuscript's Descriptions), The Centre of Great Islamic Encyclopaedia Library Publications Series, Tehran 1381HŠ/2002, vol. VI, Philosophy & Ethics, pp. 104-105.

for the purpose of locating the manuscripts of interest to us. Subsequently an analysis was carried out of the reference scientific literature relating to these codices, some of which are reported by M. T. Dānišpažūh, M. J. Esmaeili, N. Işfahānī and Y. Mahdavi (see note 2 and Appendix).

The secondary literature revealed the existence of three separate Persian translations of Avicenna's *Metaphysics*. The research carried out by us seems to suggest, though still hypothetically, the need to make some changes to this interpretative paradigm.

The table that follows gives a summary of the witnesses identified and so far known, but these are being scrupulously and carefully evaluated. The data given derive from a first comparative study of the copies in our possession and are classified according to chronology, presumed authors of the translations and corresponding part of *Metaphysics* translated. The last two columns provide additional information on the reference bibliographical sources and on the place where the copy was made, the date of the translation or copy and the name of the copyist, if these are known<sup>3</sup>.

MANUSCRIPT	TRANSLATOR (indicated in the ms.)	TRANSLATOR (indicated in the bibliogra- phy)	CONTENT	PLACE, DATE, COPYIST	BIBLIOGRAPHI- CAL SOURCES
1) Ms. 1138* R a m p u r (India), Raza Library, ff. 498	'Alī Riḍā Ṭarza'ī ibn M a w l ā n ā Şams al-Dīn Ḥalḥālī	M a w l ā n ā 'Alī Riḍā al- Ṭarza'ī ibn Şams al-Dīn al-Ḥalḥālī	P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>ilāhiyyāt</i> incorporating the Arabic text	K a b u l 1048H/1638- 9 (place and date of translation ; unknown date of copy)	S : 313

O = ms. recorded in *Handbook of Andhra Pradesh Government Oriental Manuscripts Library and Research Institute*, Osmania University Campus Hyderabad. Persian, Urdu, Arabic Books, vol. II, p. 85.

S = ms. recorded in W. H. SIDDIQI, *Fihrist-i nushahā-yi fārsī-yi kitābkhānah-i Raḍā, Rampur* (Catalogue of Persian Manuscripts of Rampur Raza Library), Diamond Printers, Delhi 1375HŞ/1996, vol. I, p. 313.

Reference websites : [www.aghazoz.org.ir](http://www.aghazoz.org.ir) ; [www.ical.ir](http://www.ical.ir) ; [www.nlai.ir](http://www.nlai.ir).

<sup>3</sup> The list of the manuscripts is in chronological order. Copies marked with \* were acquired. Other copies on microfilm and in paper form, kept at some Iranian libraries, are identified in D and F : Tehran, Dānişgā Library, ms. 2300 ; Tehran, Dānişgā Library, ms. 2303 ; Qum, Mar' ašī, ms. 1505. See DIRĀYATĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-haye Iran (Dena)* cit., vol. VI, p. 1202 and ID., *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khatti-ye Iran (Fankha)* cit., vol. IV, pp. 785-786. D and F probably refer to the oldest data published by Ḥ and DA, the authors of the respective catalogues of the Mağlis Library and the *Miškāt* collection of the University of Tehran. See Appendix : Bibliographical Sources.

2) Ms. 431 Hyderabad (India), Āṣaḥfiyya Library		‘Alī Riḍā al- Ṭarza’ī (ibn Mawlānā Šams al-Dīn Ḥalḥālī)	P e r s i a n translation of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i>		DA <sub>2</sub> : 95 <sup>a</sup> ; ES: 8 <sup>b</sup> ; IS: 100 <sup>c</sup> ; K: 492-493; O: 85
3) Ms. 7 Tabriz (Iran), Ṭiqāt al- Islām Library now in unidentified private collection <sup>d</sup>		‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥuṣaynī ‘Ariḍī (D)  ‘Alī ‘Ariḍī Siyyāhānī (DA <sub>2</sub> )  ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥuṣaynī ‘Ariḍī (F)	P e r s i a n translation of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> ; P e r s i a n translation of <i>Šifā’</i> (D)	D dates ms. 7 to 1078H/1667-8 DA <sub>2</sub> dates it to 1087H/1676-7	D, VI: 1202 <sup>e</sup> ; DA <sub>2</sub> : 95; F <sub>2</sub> : IV: 785 <sup>f</sup>

<sup>a</sup> DĀNIŠPAŽŪH, ‘Introduction’ cit., p. 95, presents two translations: the first one attributed to ‘Alī Riḍā Ṭarza’ī ibn Šams al-Dīn Ḥalḥālī and relating to ms. 2; the second one, by ‘Alī ‘Urayḍī Siyyāhānī, corresponding to copies 3, 4, 6 and 7. Dānišpažūh gives the last part of the name of the author as Ḥalḥālī, instead of Ḥalḥālī. The city of Khalkhal is in north-western Iran, in Ardabil province.

<sup>b</sup> ESMAEILI, *The Commentary Tradition on the Ilāhiyyāt of the Šifā’* cit., p. 20, lists three translations, respectively by the following: « A) ‘Alī ‘Urayḍī Imāmī of Isfahan, a student of Āqā Ḥuṣayn Khwānsārī (d. 1098 AH); B) ‘Alī Riḍā Ṭarza’ī; C) Mirzā Ḥuṣayn ‘Alī, better known as Muḥaqqiq-i Khalkhālī, a student of Mirzā Abū al-Ḥasan Jilwah (1201-1275 AH solar) ». Esmaili therefore distinguishes Ṭarza’ī from Ḥalḥālī, considering them two different authors. With respect to the third author, Esmaili in note 10 on p. 20 gives the following bibliographical reference: F. ARDEBILĪ, *Tārīkh-i Ardebil wa Dānešmandān*, vol. I (Mashhad, n.p., 1357 AH solar), p. 201.

<sup>c</sup> IŠFAHĀNĪ, ‘Introduction’ cit., p. 100, presents two Persian translations of *Metaphysics*: a first one, for which he gives no numerical references, with al-Sayyid ‘Alī al-‘Urayḍī al-Imāmī as author A); a second one, attributed to author B) ‘Alī Riḍā al-Ṭarza’ī’, with respect to copy 2.

<sup>d</sup> Info provided by Dr. Aḥmad Ḥosseini (University of Tabriz).

<sup>e</sup> DIRĀYĀTĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-haye Iran (Dena)* cit., VI, attributes the translation of *Šifā’* to ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥuṣaynī ‘Urayḍī (XI/XVII c.), as concerns mss. 3 and 5.

<sup>f</sup> Id., *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khatti-ye Iran (Fankha)* cit., IV, pp. 785-786, identifies copies 3, 4, 5 and 6 as belonging to the same translation of *Metaphysics*, ascribed to ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥuṣaynī ‘Ariḍī (XI/XVII c.).

4) Ms. 251* Tehran (Iran), Dānišgā Library ( <i>Miškāt</i> collection), ff. 390		<p>‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥ u s a y n ī ‘Arīdī (D)</p> <p>‘Alī ‘Arīdī Siyyāhānī (DA<sub>1</sub>)</p> <p>S a y y i d ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Asad Allāh Imāmī ‘ U r a y ḍ ī S i p ā h ā n ī (DA<sub>2</sub>)</p> <p>‘Alī ‘Urayāī Imāmī of Isfahan (ES)</p> <p>Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥ u s a y n ī ‘Arīdī (F)</p> <p>Anonymous (MA: 174)</p>	<p>P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> I - I X . 3 , incorporating the Arabic text</p>	<p>I s f a h a n 1084H/1673-4 (date of copy) ‘Abd al-Zahīr ibn al-Ma‘šūm (‘Abd al-Zahīr ibn al-Ma‘šūm Karahrūdī ?)<sup>8</sup></p>	<p>D, II: 133<sup>h</sup>; DA<sub>1</sub>: 199-200<sup>i</sup>; DA<sub>2</sub>: 95; ES: 8; F, IV: 785; MA: 174</p>
5) Ms. 9081* Tehran (Iran), Dānišgā Library, ff. 410		<p>‘Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥ u s a y n ī ‘Arīdī (D)</p> <p>Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥ u s a y n ī ‘Arīdī (F)</p>	<p>P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> I - I X . 3 , incorporating the Arabic text (Persian translation of <i>Šifā’</i> in D)</p>	<p>1087H/1676-7 (date of copy) Muḥammad Ma‘šūm ibn Muḥammad Bāqir</p>	<p>D, VI: 1202; F, IV: 785</p>

<sup>8</sup> Cf. ‘Abd al-Zahīr ibn al-Ma‘šūm Karahrūdī (or Garmrūdī): copyist of *Ilāhiyyāt*, ms. Ḥoy, Madrasa-i Namāzī 623 (XI/XVII). It contains: *Ilāhiyyāt* I.2-X.5. See <http://www.avicennaproject.eu/index.php?id=57>.

<sup>h</sup> DIRĀYATĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-haye Iran (Dena)* cit., II, p. 133, refers to ms. 4 as a translation of the *Metaphysics* section. *Id.*, VI, pp. 1202-1203, lists mss. 6 and 7 among the witnesses of a different anonymous translation than ms. 4.

<sup>i</sup> DĀNIŠPĀZŪH, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Ihdā’i-yi Āqā-yi Sayyid Muḥammad-i Mishkāt* cit., pp. 199-200, refers to a Persian translation of the *Ilāhiyyāt*, ms. 4, attributed to Sayyid ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Āsad Allāh Imāmī ‘Uraydī Sipāhānī. MAHDAVĪ, *Fihrist-i nusḥahā-yi muṣannafāt-i Ibn-i Sīnā* cit., p. 174, instead records copy 4 as a witness of an anonymous translation of *Metaphysics*.

6) Ms. 1912* T e h r a n (Iran), Mağlis Library, pp. 790		‘Alī ‘Arīdī S i y y ā h ā n ī (D A <sub>2</sub> )  ‘Alī ‘Urayāī Imāmī of Isfahan (ES)  Alī ibn Muḥammad Ḥ u s a y n ī ‘Arīdī (F)  Anonymous in D, H	P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> I - I X . 3 , incorporating the Arabic text ; P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Šifā</i> (D)	12th/18th c. (date of copy)	D, VI : 1 2 0 2 - 1 2 0 3 <sup>j</sup> ; D A <sub>2</sub> : 95 ; E S : 8 ; F, IV : 785- 786 ; H : 4 0 2 - 4 0 4
7) Ms. 1 8 4 0 / 2 * T e h r a n (Iran), Mağlis L i b r a r y , pp. 179-387		‘Alī ‘Arīdī S i y y ā h ā n ī (D A <sub>2</sub> )  ‘Alī ‘Urayāī Imāmī of Isfahan (ES)  Anonymous in D, F, H	P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> I.4 - VIII, 7 ; P e r s i a n translation + commentary of <i>Šifā</i> (D)	‘Abd al-Karīm ibn Hādī al- Qazvīnī ? 1318H/1900-1 (date of copy) <sup>k</sup>	D, VI : 1203 ; D A <sub>2</sub> : 95 ; E S : 8 ; F, XXI : 80 <sup>l</sup> ; H : 297-299 , 4 0 4
8) Ms. 20348- 5* T e h r a n (Iran), Millī L i b r a r y , ff. 565	‘Alī Sayyid ‘Alī al- Ḥusaynī al- ‘Uraydī al- I m ā m ī		P e r s i a n translation of <i>Ilāhiyyāt</i> & <i>Išārāt</i>		www.nlai. ir <sup>m</sup>

<sup>j</sup> DIRĀYATĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-haye Iran (Dena)* cit., VI, pp. 1202-1203, refers to mss. 6 and 7 as a translation of and comment on *Šifā* by an uncertain author.

<sup>k</sup> HĀ’IRĪ, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Majlis-i Shūrā-yi Millī* cit., p. 298, gives the name of the scribe, ‘Abd al-Karīm ibn Hādī al-Qazvīnī and the date 1318, which appear in the same code, but in the colophon of the following treatise ms. 1840/3.

<sup>l</sup> In DIRĀYATĪ, *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khattī-ye Iran (Fankha)* cit., XXI, p. 80, ms. 7 appears as an incomplete translation of *Metaphysics* containing brief comments on other works, including *Nağāt*.

<sup>m</sup> At the National Library of Tehran ms. 8 is listed among the translations of *Metaphysics* into Persian. To date, the existing literature makes no mention of it.

### III. STATE OF THE ART

As an analysis of the chart shows, the currently existing secondary literature only provides data that partly agree with one another. The divergences suggest the need for an overall reconsideration of the problem of the Persian

translations of *Metaphysics*, through an analysis of the evidence emerging from direct inspection of manuscripts (see below, New Data). For the moment let us concern ourselves with summing up the state of the art according to the present-day bibliography.

D, DA<sub>1</sub>, DA<sub>2</sub>, ES, F, IS and MZ identify translator A) Sayyid 'Alī (= 'Alī Sayyid 'Alī) ibn Muḥammad ibn Asad Allāh [al-Ḥusaynī] al-'Urayḍī (= 'Arīḍī) [al-]Imāmī [al-]Iṣfahānī (= Siyyāhānī/Sipāhānī).

DA<sub>2</sub>, ES, IS, K, O and S present the second translator B) (Mawlānā) 'Alī Riḍā Ṭarza'ī (ibn Šams al-Dīn al-Ḥalḥālī).

Finally, ES reports on a third translator C) Mirzā Ḥusayn 'Alī, Muḥaqqiq-i Ḥalḥālī.

On the basis of the bibliographical data, author A) 'Urayḍī (XI/XVII c.) appears to have almost entirely translated from Arabic to Persian the *Metaphysics* section of *Šifā'*. On the cover page of ms. 4 there is a brief biographical note, probably modern, which identifies the author with Sayyid 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Asad Allāh al-Imāmī al-Iṣfahānī, a hypothetical descendant of 'Alī 'Urayḍī, the son of Imām al-Šādiq<sup>4</sup>. Iṣfahānī is also characterized as a student of Āqā Ḥusayn ibn Muḥammad al-Ḥwānsārī (1016-1099H/1607-1687), one of the great Imamites of the Safavid epoch and also a commentator on the *Metaphysics* section of *Šifā'*<sup>5</sup>. The same note indicates that 'Urayḍī also translated the text of *Iṣārāt* into Persian<sup>6</sup>.

According to the literature data, translator B) 'Alī Riḍā Ṭarza'ī ibn Šams al-Dīn al-Ḥalḥālī would instead be the author of a second, separate Persian

<sup>4</sup> Ḡa'far ibn Muḥammad al-Šādiq (699-700/80H or 702-703/83H – 765/148H), a descendant of 'Alī, was the sixth Twelver Imām.

<sup>5</sup> Of great significance is the attested Persian translation of *Ilāhiyyāt* by Āqā Ḥusayn ibn Muḥammad al-Ḥwānsārī, of which, however, no proof has yet been found. See D. ŠAFĀ, *Tārīḫ-e adabiyāt dar Irān*, (A History of Iranian Literature), vol. V, From the beginning of the 10<sup>th</sup> century to the middle of the 12<sup>th</sup> century A.H., Part I, Ferdowsi Publication, Tehran 1378HŠ, p. 315. Ḥwānsārī wrote two commentaries upon the *Ilāhiyyāt*: the first one containing a long introduction that is missing in some manuscripts. The second manuscript is *de facto* a response to the critiques by Muḥammad Bāqir Ibn Mu' min Sabzawārī Iṣfahānī (1018-1090H/1609-1680), whose name Ḥwānsārī does not mention, but refers to him as « one of the scholars of the time ». In this commentary, Ḥwānsārī severely attacks Sabzawārī. See Ā. H. ḤWĀNSĀRĪ, *Hāshiyatu Ilāhiyyāt al-Shifā'*, ed. Ḥ. N. IṢFAHĀNĪ, Tehran 1999 and <http://www.avicennaproject.eu/index.php?id=65>. In S. H. NAŠR, M. AMINRAZAVI, *An Anthology of Philosophy in Persia. From the School of Shiraz to the Twentieth Century*, I. B. Tauris Publishers, London - New York 2015, in association with the Institute of Ismaili Studies London, vol. V, p. 283, it is reported that Mullā Raḡab 'Alī Tabrizi (d. 1080H/1669) translated *Šifā'* and *Iṣārāt* from Arabic to Persian, but at the moment we have no further notices on this.

<sup>6</sup> IṢFAHĀNĪ, 'Introduction' cit., pp. 83, 128, this author is named as Sayyid 'Alī al-'Urayḍī Darab Imāmī (XI/XVII c.). Furthermore, Iṣfahānī gives a list of the manuscript copies of Persian translations of *Ilāhiyyāt* (pp. 100-101) and a forthcoming edition of the translation/commentary is announced, p. 59.

translation, the copies of which have been identified in India. Regarding the third author mentioned C) we have no other notices.

To date it has not been possible to obtain more precise biographical data on authors B) and C) and to establish their identity with any certainty.

#### IV. NEW DATA

Seeing the conflicting information that appears in the bibliography, as examined in the previous section, a first examination was undertaken of the photographic reproductions of the manuscripts listed in the table, with the exception of 2 and 3, copies of which are not currently available.

In most cases, the exemplars examined date from the 11th-17th centuries. Mss. 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7 present multilevel editing, in which the translator gives the text of *Ilāhiyyāt* in Arabic, overlined with purple ink (mss. 1, 4, 5, 6), and afterwards the translation into Persian and the textual comment. The translation is difficult to understand, sometimes making the text unintelligible.

Mss. 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7 are probably distinct copies of the same translation, though they present some differences in the detail. Among these, the only exemplar that contains an almost complete translation of *Metaphysics* is ms. 1, which only shows a few internal lacunae. With reference to this last manuscript, the colophon clearly attributes the translation to ‘Alī Riḍā Ṭarza’ī ibn Mawlānā Šams al-Dīn Ḥalḥālī. This is the oldest witness, produced in Kabul in 1048H/1638-9:

##### T.1 Ms. 1, Colophon:

ترجمه فنّ ثالث عشر کتاب شفاء بعون إفاضات إلهیه و مددکاری ایزد بیچون در کابل در وقت چاشتگاه در تاریخ ششم ربیع الثانی در سنه هزار و چهل و هشت هجریه. ومؤلّف این ترجمه مشوّش النظام علی رضا طرزی ابن مولانا شمس الدین خلخالی.

Mss. 4, 5 and 6 seem to contain a partial version of the translation by ‘Alī Riḍā Ṭarza’ī: the Arabic text, the translation and the commentary are interrupted at treatise IX.3, followed by the colophons, in some cases containing details on the copyist and the place of copy (see table). Mss. 4, 5 and 6 are also characterized by the presence of an *incipit* and an initial addition absent in 1. Manuscript 7 gives an even shorter translation than 4, 5 and 6, because it only presents a fragmentary portion of *Metaphysics* (from I.4 to VIII.7). It seems to be possible to ascribe the translation to Ṭarza’ī.

The divergences that can be seen in this group of manuscripts could have been caused by the existence of distinct branches of tradition, by accidents of transmission or by deliberate interventions on the text. More in detail, it can be supposed that Iranian copies 4, 5 and 6 represent a branch of an independent tradition: the fact is that the absence of the final section of the translation, which the copies have in common, might be linked to the same copy. On the other hand, ms. 1 would represent a second branch of a tradition, since it shows the omission of an initial section of the translation not shared by 4, 5 and 6. In other words, Ṭarza'ī appears to have almost entirely translated the *Metaphysics* section of *Šifā'* and the copies preserved in Iran and in India would be incomplete through an accident of transmission or for other reasons still to be discovered. At the present stage of the research it is not possible to settle the issue.

After the recent acquisition of manuscript 8, still being examined, the panorama has appeared to be even more ramified: the fact is that this copy is different from all the other witnesses examined. Specifically, the manuscript contains two translations into Persian: one of *Ilāhiyyāt* and afterwards one of *Išārāt*. According to what is stated in the *incipit* of 8, both translations were done by 'Alī Sayyid 'Alī al-Ḥusaynī al-'Uraydī al-Imāmī.

T.2 Ms. 8, *Incipit*:

... برحمت ربّه علی سید علی الحسینی العریضی الإمامی که غرض ازین ترجمه  
کتاب الهی شفاء ...

At this point it is important to remember that the name of 'Uraydī appeared in the secondary literature on the Persian translations of *Metaphysics* as the author of the versions contained in 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7. However, as we have seen, mss. 5, 6 and 7 seem not to bear any trace of this name; the only mention of 'Uraydī is found instead in the modern note on the cover sheet of ms. 4. Perhaps precisely this note gave rise to the confusion that led 'Uraydī to be identified as the translator of these manuscripts, rather than Ṭarza'ī. Indeed, it seems to be an additional observation, inserted perhaps by a cataloguer or a librarian, containing information regarding the activity of a Persian translator known to him for other reasons, that is to say precisely 'Uraydī, the author of the joint translation of *Ilāhiyyāt* and *Išārāt* testified to by ms. 8. Otherwise, the note might originate from the catalogue of Dānišpažūh, regarding the *Miškāt* collection of the University of Tehran<sup>7</sup>.

<sup>7</sup> DĀNIŠPAŽŪH, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Ihdā'ī-yi Āqā-yi Sayyid Muḥammad-i Miškāt* cit., pp. 199-200. The data are also given in DIRĀYĀTĪ, *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khattī-ye Iran (Fankha)* cit., IV, p. 785 and MUNZAVĪ, *Fehrestvāra-ye Ketābhā-ye Fārsī* cit., p. 104.

## V. CONCLUSION

The direct examination of the manuscripts so far conducted would seem to point to the existence of two Persian translations of the *Metaphysics* section of *Šifā'*: the first one represented by mss. 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7 and attributable to 'Alī Riḍā Ṭarza'ī ibn Mawlānā Šams al-Dīn Ḥalḥālī; and the second one preserved by ms. 8 and ascribable to 'Alī Sayyid 'Alī al-Ḥusaynī al-'Urayḍī al-Imāmī. Therefore, 'Urayḍī would be the author of the double translation of *Ilāhiyyāt* and *Išārāt* and consequently would not bear any relationship with the translation attributed to Ḥalḥālī, preserved in copies 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7.

However, these hypotheses are yet to be verified, considering that the data obtained and so far analyzed do not make it possible to reach definitive conclusions. Only careful textual investigation can provide more certain data in support of these arguments.

## APPENDIX : BIBLIOGRAPHICAL SOURCES

There follows a list of the data published by the aforementioned studies, in order clearly to see the manuscript copies identified and the corresponding information for each of them:

DĀNIŠPAŽŪH, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Ihdā'i-yi Āqā-yi Sayyid Muḥammad-i Mishkāt, Kitābkhānah-i Dānishgāh-i Tehrān* cit., pp. 199-200:

۲۵۱ ترجمه الهیات شفا

سید علی بن محمد بن اسدالله امامی عریضی سپاهانی مترجم اشارات که شاگرد آقا حسین خوانساری (۱۰۹۸م) بوده در روزگار نگارنده ریاض العلماء (۱۱۳۰م) در گذشت شفای شیخ را بیارسی کرد (ذریعه ج ۴ ص ۹-۷۸ و ۱۱۰) نسخه ما که بند بوند سخنان شیخ در آن آمده و ترجمه لفظی و سپس گزارش شده گویا از همو باشد.

Id., 'Introduction', in IBN SĪNĀ, *Al-Nağāt min al-ğarq fi baḥr al-ḍalālāt* cit., p. 95:

ترجمه های الهی شفاء به فارسی

۱، از علی رضا طرزه ای پسر شمس الدین خلیجانی در ۱۰۴۸ در کابل نسخه ۴۳۱ فلسفه آصفیه (۳: ۴۹۲) فن ۱۳.  
۲، از علی عریضی سپاهانی مترجم اشارات ابن سینا و نگارنده هشت بهشت در ترجمه هشت کتاب حدیث (فهرست یزد: ۱: ۱۳۹ ص ۱۰۷)

بندبند متن در آن آمده و ترجمه لفظی و گزارش شده است. نسخه های آن:

۱، ۲۵۱ دانشگاه (۳: ۱۹۹) که فیلم هم دارد (۱: ۴۹ ش ۲۳۰۰)  
۲، ثقة السلام در تبریز نوشته ۱۰۸۷ (نشریه ۴: ۴۲۵)  
۳، شماره ۱۹۱۲ مجلس (۵: ۴۰۲) فیلم ۲۳۰۰ عکس. ۵۳۸۰ دانشگاه (۱: ۴۹)  
۴، شماره ۲/ ۱۸۴۰ مجلس (۵: ۴۰۴ ص ۴۵۷ نسخه) با شرح نجات اسفراینی که نخستین است و پس از آن شرح اثبات واجب که سوم است (۲۹۷) نوشته ۱۳۱۸

DIRĀYATĪ, *Fehrestvare-ye Dast-Nevesht-haye Iran (Dena)* cit., vol. II, p. 133, vol. VI, pp. 1202-1203:

الهیات شفا (ترجمه) / فلسفه / فارسی [ ۱ ]  
حسینی عریضی، علی بن محمد ( - ق ۱۱ ق )  
تهران، دانشگاه ش: ۲۵۱

الشفاء (ترجمه) / فلسفه / فارسی [ ۴ ]  
حسینی عریضی، علی بن محمد ( - ق ۱۱ ق )

تبریز، ثقة السلام ش : ۷  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۹۰۸۱  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۲۳۰۰ ف  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۲۳۰۳ ف

الشفاء (ترجمه و شرح) / فلسفه / فارسی [۲]  
 تهران، مجلس ش : ۱۹۱۲  
 تهران، مجلس ش : ۲ / ۱۸۴۰

Id., *Fehrestgān-e Noskhe-ha-ye Khatti-ye Iran (Fankha)* cit., vol. IV, pp. 785-786, vol. XXI, pp. 79-80:

الهیات شفا (ترجمه) / فلسفه / فارسی [۷]  
 حسینی عریضی، علی بن محمد، ق ۱۱ قمری  
 تبریز، ثقة السلام ش : ۷  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۲۵۱  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۹۰۸۱  
 تهران، مجلس ش : ۱۹۱۲  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۲۳۰۰ ف  
 تهران، دانشگاه ش : ۲۳۰۳ ف  
 قم، مرعشی ش : ۱۵۰۵ عکسی

الشفاء (ترجمه و شرح) / فلسفه / فارسی [۱]  
 تهران، مجلس ش : ۲ / ۱۸۴۰

ESMAEILI, *The Commentary Tradition on the Ilāhiyyāt of the Shifā'* cit., p. 8:

«By 'translations' only Persian translations of the *Shifā'* are meant. Manuscript catalogues consulted so far make mention of at least three translations:

1) In the library of Tehran University there is a translation of the *Metaphysics* of the *Shifā'* that was made by 'Alī 'Urayāī Imāmī of Isfahan, a student of Āqā Ḥusayn Khwānsārī (d. 1098 AH). The catalogue of the library of the Majles-i Shūrā-yi Eslāmī, likewise in Tehran, mentions an 'anonymous' translation of the *Metaphysics* of the *Shifā'*. After comparison of this translation with the one in Tehran University, it became clear that it is the same one, done by 'Alī 'Urayāī.

2) In addition to the above, the catalogue of the Āṣefiye Library in Haydarābād Deccan (India) mentions a translation of the *Metaphysics* of the *Shifā'* that was made by one 'Alī Riqā Ṭarze'ī, whom I have not been able to identify so far. But given that the manuscript in question was completed in Kabul in 1048 AH, Ṭarze'ī made his translation no later than this date.

3) A third translation was made in the thirteenth century AH by Mirzā Ḥusayn 'Alī, better known as Muḥaqqiq-i Khalkhālī, a student of Mirzā Abū al-Ḥasan Jilwah (1202-1275 AH solar). It is not clear whether the translation by Muḥaqqiq-i Khalkhālī only comprises the *Metaphysics* of the *Shifā'* or also other parts of it».

ḤĀ'IRĪ, *Fihrist-i kitābkhānah-i Majlis-i Shūrā-yi Millī* cit., pp. 297-298, 402-404:

۱۸۴۰ / ۲ ترجمه فن سیزدهم شفاء شیخ الرئیس (= الهیات) در ۲۰۷ صفحه (ص ۱۷۹-۳۸۷)  
 ۱۸۴۰ شفاء (ترجمه و شرح...)  
 ۲۱۹۱. شفاء (ترجمه و شرح...)

*Handbook of Andra Pradesh Government Oriental Manuscripts Library and Research Institute* cit, p. 85:

۴۳۱، علی رضا طرزی بن شمس الدین خلخالی، ترجمه شفاء

IŞFAHĀNĪ, 'Introduction', in IBN SĪNĀ, *Ibn-i Sīnā Kitāb al-Shifā'* (*Metaphysics*) cit., p. 100:

۶۵. الطرازه اي، علی رضا، ترجمه الهیات ← أضفیة کابل / ۴۳۱  
 ۶۶. العریضی الامامی، السید علی، ترجمه الهیات من المقالة الاولى الی لولسط المقالة الثامنة ← هذه المجموعة

KANTÜRĪ, *Fihrist-i kutub-i arabī wa fārsī wa urdū maḥzūnah-i Kutubhānah-i Āṣafīyah-i Sarkār-i 'Alī* cit., pp. 492-493:

۱۳۴، علی رضا طرزی بن شمس مولان الدین الخلخالی، ترجمه شفاء، فن ثالث عشر

MAHDĀVĪ, *Fihrist-i nuṣṣahā-yi muṣannafāt-i Ibn-i Sīnā* cit., p. 174:

الهیات: طبق نسخه کتابخانه مشکات شماره ۱۵۲ (مورخ ۴۸۰۱ ق) مترجم نامعلوم

MUNZAVĪ, *Fehrestvāra-ye Ketābhā-ye Fārsī* cit., pp. 104-105:

ترجمه تنها بخش الهیات آن از سید علی فرزند محمد فرزند اسد الله امامی عریضی سپاهانی شاگرد مجلسی دوم (د ۱۱۱۰ ق) و آقا حسین خوانساری (د ۱۰۹۸ ق) بوده و به روزگار نگارنده «ریاض العلماء» (د ۱۱۳۰ ق) در گذشته است. و از هموست «اشارات، ترجمه» (هف).

صفا (۵/۳۱۵) ضمن بر شمردن کارهای خوانساری پیشگفته از ”ترجمه الهیات شفا“ نام برده که گویا همین است و لغزشی است و این ترجمه از شاگردش است نه او.

SIDDIQI, *Fihrist-i nushahā-yi fārsī-yi kitābkhānah-i Raḡā, Rampur cit.*, p. 313:

ترجمه کتاب الشفاء فن ثالث عشر (فن الهیات) ۱۱۳۸  
 مولانا علی رضا الطرزی بن شمس الدین الخلیجالی  
 (۵۱۰۴۸)

SISMEL - EDIZIONI DEL GALLUZZO

## ABSTRACT

*On the Persian Translations of Avicenna's Ilāhiyyāt*

This paper presents a preliminary study of the translations into Persian of the *Metaphysics* section of Avicenna's *Šifā'*. During the Safavid dynasty a considerable number of commentaries and translations from Arabic into Persian contributed to the spread of the philosophical works of the complex Islamic intellectual scenario. The Peripatetic legacy, the *išrāqī* current, the *šūfī* tradition and the Iṣfahān School deeply influenced both the reading of philosophical texts and the doctrinal and terminological choices of the time. The Persian translations of Avicenna's *Metaphysics* are undoubtedly to be inserted in this varied context. The present research provides a new focus on the transmission and reception of Avicenna's text in the Persian cultural environment, but the manuscript heritage of this production still remains to be explored in detail.

IVANA PANZECA, Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa  
ivana.panzeca@sns.it

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Research Council under the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013)/ERC grant agreement n° 339621.

SISMEL - EDIZIONI DEL GALLUZZO

